External forcing as a metronome for Atlantic multidecadal variability

Odd Helge Otterå1,2,3,*, Mats Bentsen1,2,3, Helge Drange1,2,4 and Lingling Suo2,3

Instrumental records, proxy data and climate modelling show that multidecadal variability is a dominant feature of North Atlantic sea-surface temperature variations5-7, with potential impacts on regional climate8. To understand the observed variability and to gauge any potential for climate predictions it is essential to identify the physical mechanisms that lead to this variability, and to explore the spatial and temporal characteristics of multidecadal variability modes. Here we use a coupled ocean-atmosphere general circulation model to show that the phasing of the multidecadal fluctuations in the North Atlantic during the past 600 years is, to a large degree, governed by changes in the external solar and volcanic forcings. We find that volcanoes play a particularly important part in the phasing of the multidecadal variability through their direct influence on tropical sea-surface temperatures, on the leading mode of northern-hemisphere atmosphere circulation and on the Atlantic thermohaline circulation. We suggest that the implications of our findings for decadal climate prediction are twofold: because volcanic eruptions cannot be predicted a decade in advance, longer-term climate predictability may prove challenging, whereas the systematic post-eruption changes in ocean and atmosphere may hold promise for shorter-term climate prediction.

Coherent, large-scale sea-surface temperature (SST) variations are observed in the Atlantic Ocean on interannual to multidecadal timescales. A well-known, basin-wide variation is the Atlantic multidecadal oscillation (AMO), marked by alternation of warm and cold SST anomalies in the North Atlantic with a period of about 60–80 years9. Analysis of collections of multiple palaeo-proxies10,11 and tree-ring data12 indicates that AMO variability extends, at least, several centuries back in time. It has been suggested, on the basis of climate model simulations, that these variations are internally driven and related to multidecadal fluctuations in the Atlantic meridional overturning circulation (AMOC; refs 2,8,9). However, AMO is not solely driven by the changes in the AMOC, and attempts have been made to identify from observations the part of the signal that is linked to more global changes10,11. If internal variability in the AMOC is the determining factor for the AMO, it suggests that it may be predictable12. On the other hand, if external forcing agents such as total solar irradiance (TSI) variations and volcanic eruptions are important drivers, then these will have to be taken into account13. Identifying the relative role of internal variability and external forcing agents in driving multidecadal variability is therefore a key issue.

Here we use a fully coupled climate model, the Bergen climate model (BCM; ref. 14) (see Supplementary Section S1 for details), to demonstrate that external forcing has been instrumental in pacing the multidecadal variability in the Atlantic region over the past 600 years. A total of seven simulations were carried out. In the first simulation, referred to as CTL600, the external forcing agents had no year-to-year variations and greenhouse-gas concentrations and tropospheric sulphate aerosols were fixed at pre-industrial (1850) levels. The second simulation, referred to as EXT600, included the external forcing due to changes in the amount of volcanic aerosols and variations in TSI for the past 600 years15 (Fig. 1a). The anthropogenic forcings were kept constant as in CTL600. Finally, five simulations covering the period 1850–1999 were run differing only by slight changes in the initial state. The ensemble mean of these simulations is referred to as ALL150. Here changes in tropospheric aerosols (Supplementary Fig. S1) and well-mixed greenhouse gases (Supplementary Fig. S2) were included in addition to the external forcing.

The simulated low-pass-filtered (see Methods) northern-hemisphere (NH) temperature back to 1400 (Fig. 1b, blue) generally falls within the spread of proxy-based NH temperature reconstructions (Fig. 1b, grey shading). Moreover, the simulated NH temperature in ALL150 (Fig. 1b, red) is highly correlated (R = 0.9) to the instrumental NH temperature16 (Fig. 1b, black). In EXT600 (Fig. 1b, blue) a relatively warm early-to-mid 20th century is found, with a general cooling over the past 40 years. The external forcing cannot therefore explain the late-20th-century warming17.

The observed AMO index for the past 150 years is characterized by warm phases in the late 19th century and from the 1930s to the 1960s, whereas cold phases occur during the first decades of the 20th century and from the mid-1960s to the 1980s (Fig. 1c, black). The simulated AMO in ALL150 is significantly correlated with the observations (R = 0.68) in terms of its phasing, but is too weak in amplitude (Fig. 1c, red and blue shading). However, the spread of the five ensemble members covers most of the variations in the observed AMO (Fig. 1c, grey shading). In contrast, the AMO in EXT600 shows no significant correlation to the observed AMO (Fig. 1c, blue). It should, however, be noted that for some periods the AMO in EXT600 follows the observed AMO closely, suggesting some role for the external forcing in pacing the AMO. On the other hand, the cold phase in the early 20th century is not seen in EXT600, but is evident in ALL150 (Fig. 1c). This points toward an anthropogenic origin for this signal. The observed spatial pattern of the AMO since 1850 (Fig. 1d) has some similarities to the one simulated in ALL150 (Fig. 1c), in particular in the northern North Atlantic and off the west coast of Africa.

The simulated AMO and AMOC indices for EXT600 are shown in Fig. 2a together with reconstructed AMO indices based on multiproxy4 (Fig. 2a, dark green) and tree-ring2 (Fig. 2a, light green) data. The correlations between the simulated and reconstructed AMO indices are positive (multiproxy R = 0.24; treering R = 0.26), but barely significant. However, strong covaritions

1Uni Bjerknes Center, Allégaten 55, N-5007 Bergen, Norway, 2Bjerknes Center for Climate Research, Allégaten 55, N-5007 Bergen, Norway, 3Nansen Environmental and Remote Sensing Center, Thormøhlensgate 47, N-5006 Bergen, Norway, 4Geophysical Institute, University of Bergen, Allégaten 70, N-5007 Bergen, Norway. *e-mail: Odd.Otterå@uni.no.
passive anomalies in the tropical North Atlantic (Fig. 2c). As the associated PC3 is positively correlated to the AMO (Fig. 2a,f, pink), this suggests that AMOC influence is mostly restricted to the sub-polar region in ext600. Interestingly, the corresponding EOF in CTL600 is characterized by a dipole structure in the Atlantic, with basin-wide positive anomalies in the North Atlantic and negative anomalies in the South Atlantic (Supplementary Fig. S3). The latter is significantly correlated to the AMOC, with the AMOC leading by about 5–10 years, suggesting a key role for the AMOC in setting the basin-wide Atlantic SSTs in CTL600 (refs 2,8,9).

Positive TSI anomalies lead, through radiative forcing, to an SST increase in the North Atlantic that tends to weaken the AMOC (refs 18,19), in line with the projected response under global-warming conditions80. In ext600, such an effect is found with negative (but not significant) correlations between the TSI forcing and the AMOC, with about 10 years lag (Fig. 2d, purple).

Positive TSI anomalies lead, through radiative forcing, to an SST increase in the North Atlantic that tends to weaken the AMOC (refs 18,19), in line with the projected response under global-warming conditions80. In ext600, such an effect is found with negative (but not significant) correlations between the TSI forcing and the AMOC, with about 10 years lag (Fig. 2d, purple). However, the negative correlations for the total forcing are larger

Figure 1 | Observed and simulated northern hemisphere temperature and Atlantic multidecadal oscillation. a, Volcanic and TSI forcings15. b, Observed (ref. 16, black) and simulated NH surface-air-temperature anomalies in ext600 (blue) and all150 (red) together with the concentration of overlapping NH temperature reconstructions (ref. 17, shading). c, AMO indices for the past 150 years for observations (black), ext600 (blue) and all150 (red and blue shading). The grey shaded region represents the standard deviation of the individual ensemble members. d, Observed spatial pattern obtained by regressing the detrended and low-pass-filtered SST data on a standardized version of the AMO index. e, The same as d, but for all150. Correlations ($\alpha < 0.1$) and root mean square errors between all150 and observations are shown in b and c.
Figure 2 | The role of external forcing for Atlantic multidecadal variability.  

a, Simulated standardized indices of AMO (black), AMOC (purple), global SST PC1 (grey) and PC3 (pink) together with reconstructed standardized AMO indices based on multiple proxies (ref. 4, dark green) and tree-ring data (ref. 7, light green). Correlations ($\alpha < 0.1$) and root mean square errors between EXT600 and reconstructions are also shown.  

b, Regression of global SST in EXT600 on PC1.  
c, The same as b, but for PC3.  
d, Cross-correlations of the simulated AMO, PC1, PC3 and AMOC indices with the TSI forcing in EXT600. Positive lags mean that the forcing is leading.  
e, The same as d, but for correlations with the total (TSI + volcanoes) forcing.  
f, Cross-correlations of the simulated AMO, PC1 and PC3 indices with the AMOC index. Positive lags mean that the AMOC is leading. In d–f significance levels ($\alpha < 0.05$) are shown in grey shading.

and significant (Fig. 2e, purple), suggesting an important role for volcanoes in AMOC.

Also, significant negative correlations are found between the AMO and the AMOC, with the AMO leading by about 10 years (Fig. 2f, black). This is due to the fact that basin-wide Atlantic SSTs, as reflected in the AMO index, are dominated by the much larger (area-averaged) tropical North Atlantic region, which is largely controlled by external forcing in EXT600. This implies that the AMOC reaches its minimum (maximum) values about 10 years after the AMO reaches its highest (lowest) values. Consequently, there is no one-to-one relationship between the AMOC and the AMO in EXT600, in contrast to CTL600.

The impact of the winter North Atlantic oscillation (NAO; ref. 21) on the North Atlantic Ocean, and notably on the AMOC, has been extensively discussed in the literature. The general ocean response to interannual NAO variability in the BCM
Previous studies have suggested lagged relationships between low-frequency TSI variations and the NAO (refs 19,24). The proposed mechanisms involve atmospheric teleconnections from the Pacific Ocean19 as well as stratosphere–troposphere coupling24. In EXT600, we find no significant correlation between the simulated NAO and the applied TSI forcing (Fig. 3d, orange). However, there is a significant negative correlation between the NAO and the total external forcing, suggesting a potential role for volcanoes. In EXT600, positive or increasing NAO is typically associated with large tropical volcanic eruptions (Fig. 3c, dashed lines). It is known from both observations and other modelling studies that large tropical eruptions have a tendency to induce a positive NAO response, causing the well-known post-eruption winter warming phenomenon over NH land masses25,26. However, climate models have only shown limited ability in simulating this robust, observation-based feature27, possibly linked to inadequate treatment of stratosphere–troposphere dynamical interactions.

In EXT600, the volcanic aerosols are injected directly into the stratosphere, where they can modify both the short-wave and long-wave radiation26. Because of this, the volcanic eruptions lead to strong heating of the lower tropical stratosphere by absorption of terrestrial and solar near-infrared radiation (Fig. 4a). This layer is then expanded, producing an enhanced pole-to-equator temperature difference, also increasing the geopotential height gradient (Fig. 4b, red). The strengthened polar vortex that follows (Fig. 4b, blue) traps the wave energy of the tropospheric circulation, and the NAO dominates the winter circulation (Fig. 4c), producing winter warming over large parts of the NH land masses (Fig. 4d). We also find a strong response in the total heat flux in the Labrador Sea after large eruptions, tending to increase the local buoyancy forcing in the Labrador Sea, play an important role in the phasing of the multidecadal variability of the AMOC.

Figure 3 | Simulated North Atlantic oscillation and Atlantic meridional overturning circulation. a, Simulated standardized NAO (red and blue shading), AMOC (black) and Labrador Sea heat-flux (purple; positive values indicate flux to the atmosphere) indices in CTL600. b, Cross-correlations of the NAO index with the solar- and total-external-forcing time series for CTL600. The grey-shaded region represents the significance levels (α < 0.05). Positive lags mean that the NAO is leading. c, The same as a, but for EXT600. Large tropical eruptions are indicated with dashed lines. d, The same as b, but for EXT600. The cross-correlations of the NAO index with the solar- and total-external-forcing time series are also shown.
and in the BCM also through their tendency to induce positive phases of the NAO.

There are possible caveats to the presented findings. For example, it could be argued that the BCM underestimates the internal variability of the AMOC on multidecadal timescales. This question is, however, difficult to adequately address in the absence of instrumental observations of the AMOC. Furthermore, the TSI reconstruction used here is in the upper end of recent estimates\(^{17}\). Further sensitivity studies, with different TSI reconstructions, are therefore necessary to clarify the role of this forcing in Atlantic SST variability.

Although the external forcing is clearly important for the AMO characteristics in the BCM (Supplementary Section S4 and Fig. S6), it cannot explain all of the simulated variability. In the model, and also probably in nature, there is an interplay between the intrinsic climate variability and the external forcing. Rather, we conclude that the external forcing acts as a metronome for the Atlantic multidecadal variability. In view of this, the frequency and intensity
of external forcing need to be better understood and quantified to produce reliable near-term climate forecasts.

Methods

Forcing. The TSI forcing is incorporated as variations in the effective solar constant in the BCM. This modifies the top of the atmosphere short-wave flux in Etx600 and all150. The volcanic aerosol forcing includes the monthly optical depths at 0.55 μm in the middle of the visible spectrum in four bands (90°N–30°N, 30°N–equator, equator–30°S and 30°S–90°S). The aerosol loading was distributed in each model level in the stratosphere using a weighting function. The volcanic mass of the stratospheric aerosols was then calculated at each grid-point and model level in the stratosphere by dividing the total aerosol concentration by the total air mass of all stratospheric levels at that grid point. In Fig. 1a the original aerosol loading values have been converted to radiative forcing by dividing by 30 and multiplying by 23.5 (ref. 29). The changes in well-mixed greenhouse gas concentrations and tropospheric aerosols are taken from the forcing data set prepared for the EU project ENSEMBLES. Details of the forcing data can be found at http://www.cnrm.meteo.fr/ensembles/public/results/results.html.

Definition of indices. The simulated and reconstructed NH surface-air-temperature anomalies are calculated with respect to a 1500–1899 reference period. The observed NH temperature anomalies are given with respect to a 1961–1990 reference period, but adjusted here by +0.45 °C so that they have the same 1881–1990 mean as all150. The observed and simulated AMO indices were defined as the annual mean SST averaged over the region 0°N–60°N, 75°W–7.5°W. The observed AMO index is calculated on the basis of the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration extended reconstructed SST data set. The AMO indices calculated from observations and all150 have been linearly detrended. A common diagnostic for the strength of the Atlantic thermohaline circulation is the maximum strength of the AMOC. In this study we define the AMOC index as the maximum of the Atlantic streamfunction between 20°N and 50°N. Alternative formulations, such as the maximum of the Atlantic streamfunction at 30°N or the leading PC of the overturning streamfunction, yield very similar results (not shown). The NAO indices for ctl600 and ext600 are defined as the first PC of mean winter sea-level pressure (December–February) for all points north of 20°N. The corresponding spatial patterns are shown in Supplementary Fig. 57. The Labrador Sea heat-flux indices are calculated by averaging over the Labrador Sea mixing region (Supplementary Fig. 55) and over the extended winter season (November–April). The lower-stratosphere geopotential height gradient is estimated by calculating a linear least-square fit to the zonal-mean geopotential height, and then calculating the equator-to-pole (0°N–90°N) difference.

Ensemble initialization technique. In all150, perturbations to the initial conditions were made using the common method of taking different atmospheric, but identical ocean, start conditions for the model. Start conditions were made using the common method of taking different atmospheric, but identical ocean, start conditions for the model, and the rate of change of the forcing was mimicked by adjusting the effective number of independent observations. Significance levels were calculated using a standard t test. Autocorrelation is taken into account by adjusting the effective number of independent observations.

Received 1 March 2010; accepted 10 August 2010; published online 12 September 2010.

References


Acknowledgements

We thank M. Miles, T. Eldværk and T. Furevik for comments on an earlier version of the manuscript. This study was financed by the Research Council of Norway through the NorClim and ARCWARM projects, and by the Program of Supercomputing. Financial support by the EU FP6 Integrated Project ENSEMBLES (Contract 505539) is...
acknowledged. This study also contributes to the EU FP6 integrated project THOR, and the DecCen project financed by the Research Council of Norway. This is Publication A296 from the Bjerknes Centre for Climate Research.

Author contributions
O.H.O. conceived the study, designed the model experiments and wrote the initial manuscript. O.H.O., M.B. and L.S. carried out the BCM experiments. O.H.O. processed the model results and did the main analyses. H.D. contributed to the scientific results through discussions and analyses. All authors participated in writing the paper and analysing the results.

Additional information
The authors declare no competing financial interests. Supplementary information accompanies this paper on www.nature.com/naturegeoscience. Reprints and permissions information is available online at http://npg.nature.com/reprintsandpermissions. Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to O.H.O.